

Discussion Paper Series

RIEB

Kobe University

DP2017-10

**The Role of Meta-organising in
Legitimacy Recovery: The Case of
Frozen Food Category in Japan**

**Takahiro ENDO
Nidhi SRINIVAS
Yuki TSUBOYAMA**

March 31, 2017



Research Institute for Economics and Business Administration

Kobe University

2-1 Rokkodai, Nada, Kobe 657-8501 JAPAN

The role of meta-organising in legitimacy recovery: The case of frozen food category in Japan

Takahiro Endo (endo.takahiro@gmail.com)

Research Institute for Economics and Business Administration, Kobe University

Nidhi Srinivas (nidhisrinivas1@gmail.com)

Milano The New School of Management and Policy

Yuki Tsuboyama (ytsuboyama@gmail.com)

Graduate School of Commerce, Hitotsubashi University

Abstract

This article aims to examine a crucial issue in Industrial Relations by taking stock of developments in Organization Studies. It seeks to provide insights into the role of employers' collective action, which responds to a call for renewing attention to its role and socio-economic implications in Industrial Relations. In particular, the article sheds light on how employers' meta-organising, involving multiple organisations, recover social credibility, known as legitimacy. The case study in Japanese frozen food provides insights into tactics and consequences concerning meta-organising involving key stakeholders by an employers' association for recovering legitimacy of frozen food category.

Introduction

In Industrial Relations (IR), the role of employers' collective action through employers' associations (EAs) tends to be treated as given (Barry & Wilkinson, 2011). Apart from notable exceptions (Traxler, 2004, 2008, 2010), their role had been under shadowed by the role of organised labour through unions (O'Sullivan and Royle, 2014). Against the backdrop of this, recently, IR scholars rightly point out the necessity to bring EAs and their roles back into the IR research (Barry, 2016; Kornelakis, 2014; Sheldon et al., 2014).

This article agrees with a broader notion of the recent call that intends to embrace the role of EAs. In order to extend the existing understanding of the role of EAs, we draw on concepts developed in Organization Studies (OS). In particular, this article focuses on EAs' activities concerning social credibility or reliability, known as legitimacy (Suchman, 1995; Vaara et al., 2006). By examining the trajectory of legitimacy research in OS, it will be shown that meta-organising, which needs to coordinate various organisations for a certain direction (Berkowitz

& Dumez, 2016), in the phase of legitimacy recovery is a relevant but under-researched topic. Importantly, meta-organising and EAs are highly related, since EAs, by definition, involves coordination with member companies as well as other non-member but important organisations, such as key stakeholders.

In order to examine the role of EAs in recovering legitimacy, an EA's activities in Japanese frozen food was selected for a detailed case study. Japanese frozen food manufacturers suffered from severe damage to the legitimacy of their product category due to major accidents involving mislabelling and food tampering. An EA in Japanese frozen food aimed to recover legitimacy by breaking apart from the past and influencing key stakeholders.

In what follows, the article firstly examines the angle for the analysis. Then, follows the method section, which explains data collection and analysis procedure. The following section presents the case analysis of an EA's collective action for recovering legitimacy after the crisis. Finally, the argument is summarised and the conclusion is made.

Angle

Employers' role in IR

In IR, Mancur Olson's seminal work on collective actions (Olson, 2009) remains relevant, given its influence in the discipline. Importantly, his analytical focus is not limited to collective action by labours. Rather, it does include one by employers. However, IR researchers have tended to treat the role of employers' collective action as one of 'given' environmental factors (Barry & Wilkinson, 2011). That is, IR researchers tend to focus on the processes and consequences of labour unions' collective action as primary research agenda. Consequently, EAs' activities, even though relevant, tend to be treated in an ad-hoc manner since the key attention has been paid to labour unions (O'Sullivan and Royle, 2014).

Franz Traxler, exceptionally, sheds light on the role of EA in a comparative perspective (Traxler, 2004, 2008, 2010). His work compares the largest peak EA, with cross-sectoral membership, among OECD economies, in terms of its activities and memberships. While Traxler's research provides useful insights into the demography of EAs, it falls short of embracing varieties of EAs apart from the peak EA as well as detailed activities of EAs, even with respect to the peak EA.

In nutshell, IR researchers tend to ignore the role of EAs. However, recently, IR scholars point out significant problems of not adequately taking EAs' activities and their socio-economic implications into account (Barry, 2016;

Kornelakis, 2014; Sheldon et al., 2014). Consequently, they call for an extensive examination of activities of EAs and their wider implications for IR system. This article recognises the importance of responding to the call. In the next section, key concepts for analysing the role of EAs will be examined.

Meta-organising and legitimacy recovery

In order to shed light on the role of EAs' collective action, this article draws on the concepts of legitimacy and meta-organising mainly developed in OS. OS, particularly institutional theory, has provided useful insights into the relationship between organising and legitimacy, which is taken place in an institutional field where relevant actors interact each other in a way distinct from other fields and that provides a unit of analysis for researchers (Fligstein & McAdam, 2012). On the one hand, in building and maintaining legitimacy for appropriate audience (Li et al., 2007), organising needs to establish congruence with widespread norms (Déjean et al, 2004; Hargadon & Douglas, 2001) and incumbent networks (Forstenlechner & Mellahi, 2011 ; Human & Provan, 2000). This may be done by persuading related parties (Suddaby & Greenwood, 2005; Vaara et al., 2006) and through meta-organising that involves coordination between multiple organisations (Brusson et al., 2012). On the other hand, legitimacy can be lost if such organising is regarded to be deviant from such norms and incumbent networks by key audiences (Jonsson et al., 2010). Therefore such research reminds us of how the legitimacy of frozen food category is entwined with particular organisational contexts, including stable networks among dominant state and industry actors.

A less established aspect of such studies shows how organising can *repair* legitimacy when institutional fields suffer a severe crisis such as the one this article examines. In institutional fields, a particular discrediting characteristic of actors or objects may come to represent them as their core trait. This is known as stigmatisation, which may be done by key stakeholders' continuous efforts to establish the linkage (Paetzold et al., 2008; Tracey & Phillips, 2015). A few studies provide insights into individual and organisational level repairing of legitimacy, often, a recovery from stigmatisation (Haislip et al., 2015; Lutgen-Sandvik, 2008; Richardson et al., 2015).

However, the question remains underexplored concerning *how meta-organising initiatives repair legitimacy crises*. Meta-organising entails mobilising collective action between multiple organisations, including the organisation of quite different kinds such as state-level regulatory agencies,

consumer watchdogs, media outlets, and industry-level producers (Berkowitz & Dumez, 2016). Such cross-organizational mobilising raises theoretical questions that are distinct from those regarding individual organisations and their particular movements within institutional fields.

Methods

To recap, this article examines the role of EA, neglected research topics in IR, from the concepts mainly developed in OS. In particular, it regards EA's collective action as meta-organising in the phase of recovering legitimacy. Considering these theoretical issues, this paper purposively selected the Japanese frozen food field for closer scrutiny (Palys, 2008). Since the Japanese frozen food field witnessed legitimacy crisis and the EA's active recovery activities, this article regards this case as one representing 'theory guided sampling'.

In relation to the Japanese economy, several IR researchers have shed light on Shunto (spring wage offensive), where labour unions and EAs play an important part (Benson, 2012; Benson & Gospel, 2008; Sako, 1997). However, again, regarding Shunto, the primary attention has been paid to unions rather than EAs. Moreover, EAs activities may not be limited to wage issues such as represented in Shunto, which further justifies the focus of this study.

Our data collection and analysis was composed of two stages. At the first stage, the emphasis was on making sense of the whole picture. By examining the secondary data, we track processes and consequences of two legitimacy crises that occurred in this field, which is summarised in Table 1. As seen in Table 2, we relied on secondary data produced by multiple actors, including an EA in the field (the Japan Frozen Food Association), frozen food manufacturers, consumer activist groups, governments and mass media. The data by governments and frozen food manufacturers provided insights into how legitimacy was damaged due to incidents involving J-MinceCo and C-DumplingCo. The EA's meta-organising was examined by mainly referring to the data produced by themselves in the form of monthly newsletters. Furthermore, media source was partly useful for examining the EA's meta-organising, in particular, those issued by the weekly trade paper "*Reito Shokuhin Shimibun*". In order to examine the perception of frozen food, data from media and consumer activists were useful.

Table 1 about here

Table 2 about here

At the second stage, we intended to make sense of *meta-organising for recovering legitimacy in the field* in terms of key actors, processes and consequences. In brief, the crises resulted from mislabelling in the case of a Japanese meat manufacturer, J-MinceCo, and contamination in the case of a Chinese food manufacturer, C-DumplingCo. Both of these manufacturers comprise one of the sub-fields of the frozen food field, that of ingredient supplier (J-MinceCo) and original equipment manufacturer (C-DumplingCo). Put simply J-MinceCo provided minced meat that forms a key ingredient in meat products sold by other companies, while C-DumplingCo produced frozen dumplings on behalf of other firms in the field. Following these incidents, the legitimacy of frozen food was significantly damaged. The EA launched meta-organising for recovering legitimacy, developing a new certificate and influencing media and consumer activist groups. Regarding a new certificate development, we concentrated on how the EA made a distinction between the new certificate and the previous certificate together with its implication for member companies.

With respect to influencing media and consumer activist groups, we embraced the EA's relevant efforts. In summary, the EA coordinated guided factory tours in China, advertised their new certification system in their newsletters since April 2008, every issue (The Japan Frozen Food Association, 2008), and held several seminars with dozens of participants to display the effectiveness of the new certification (The Japan Frozen Food Association, 2009b). Among these efforts, the guided factory tours were most effective since they involved large-scale 'consequences' in terms of its visible impacts on the media and consumer activist groups. The content of the tours organised by the EA together with its implications for key stakeholders (the mass media and consumer activist groups) were fleshed out. In terms of the implication for the mass media, the EA pointed out certain media coverage as the result of the tours. Except for one TV programme, all of the articles in newspapers and magazines were scrutinised. With regard to that for consumer activist groups, the interaction before and after the tours were examined by referring to the EA's monthly newsletters, industry journals and consumer activist groups' websites and monthly newsletters.

Case study

Legitimacy crisis: Stigmatisation centring around two incidents

Food labels comprise an essential aspect of food-related legitimacy. In Japan, the influential food certification is by the JAS (Japan Agricultural Standards), which is concerned with the safety of all agricultural produce, including frozen food. The JAS is a government agency, independent and apart from industry actors. It issues a certificate that confirms that the agricultural products meet defined standards of health.

Both the companies being considered here, J-MinceCo and C-DumplincCo became successful by offering low-cost ingredients or products. J-MinceCo's processed meat was a key ingredient for popular frozen croquettes that were sold by multiple frozen food manufacturers. Similarly C-DumplincCo provided frozen dumplings to a Japanese frozen food manufacturer which in turn sold these dumplings wholesale to major food retailers in Japan. J-MinceCo's fortunes especially improved dramatically over time due to the company's mastery of low-cost production techniques. By the early 2000s J-MinceCo had established a reputation of producing low-cost 'minced beef'. In fact the government acknowledged the company's 'innovative' minced meat production through a commendation given by the Minister of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology. The commendation noted the company's invention of a minced meat machine that could allegedly mix fat and red meat evenly.

Crucially, J-MinceCo's techniques involved mixing beef with other animal ingredients. That is to say minced beef was not really beef (Company report, 2007). While it is evident that due to the low costs involved, such ersatz beef production was attractive to the company, it is not clear why regulators did not intervene earlier to stop the practice. In fact, while employees of the company were complicit in this mixing of beef with other animal products, some of them, quite early on, became whistle-blowers and alerted relevant regulators. However the concerned regulators took no real measures in response for several years.

It seems probable that the companies that were sourcing their minced meat from J-MinceCo were aware that what they were purchasing was not solely beef but a mince of different meats (Company report, 2007, 2008a). But it was to their advantage to continue their sourcing, in order to keep their product's prices competitively low. From the perspective of regulators their primary focus appears to have been to maintain the stability of existing norms. This meant to not 'betray' the trust of J-MinceCo and other companies in terms of their irregular labelling practices, but rather to gently guide them towards an acceptable harmonious direction. This meant that JAS continued to certify these products as meeting

acceptable standards.

However, adverse media coverage broke out in June 2007 that reported J-MinceCo's mislabelling of beef. This coverage triggered a large-scale investigation of the company. Shortly after, in December 2007 and January 2008, 10 people in Japan were reported with food poisoning, including an infant that lost consciousness due to the seriousness of the ailment. All of them had consumed dumplings supplied by C-DumplingCo, distributed by a major Japanese retailer, Co-op. The ensuing police investigation revealed that excessive amount of chemicals such as methamidophos had been added to the dumpling skins and ingredients. The Japanese frozen food manufacturer that had sold these products recalled them and ceased supplies from C-DumplingCo. This scandal generated further media attention on frozen food production. Many media were especially suspicious about the production having originated from China. It remains unclear how many and to what extent C-DumplingCo's worker(s) were involved in food tampering (Company report, 2008b). However these two cases cast a sharp light on the frozen food field and consumer trust in food labels dramatically plummeted. In particular, media and consumer activist groups, on the whole, expressed doubts about the quality of frozen food after the two incidents.

Meta-organising for legitimacy recovery

Due to the media coverage crisis of credibility concerning frozen food now became a core concern. The government reviewed the manner in which the JAS certificate had been operated for both companies (Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries 2007, 2008). They decided to make site inspection much stricter. At the same time, the EA for frozen food clarified its annual plan for 2008. They aimed to allocate the maximum amount of resources on recovering credibility of frozen food. In particular, the annual plan of that year pointed out the necessity of implementing the two major activities in their monthly newsletter:

This year's two pillars of activities are influencing mass media and consumer groups, on the one hand, and disseminating information regarding our **new certification system**, on the other. With respect to influencing the mass media, it is necessary to arrange guided tours for those in the mass media and let them have a **right recognition** regarding frozen food production and distribution system. It would be necessary to arrange ones as soon as possible (emphasis added, Reito Shokuhin Joho

[Monthly Newsletter for Frozen Food] 2008, January, No.396, p.46).

As a result of introducing new certificate system where frozen food was concerned, the producers receiving JAS certification drastically dropped in number (as seen in Table 3). The JAS certification had become simply redundant. The new certificate can be seen as a symbolic effort to break away from tainted past, to start afresh. Once frozen food producers, including suppliers, obtained a certificate, they would hold its status for five years. In 2012, 395 producers, including seven Chinese ones, were certified. At the same time, the JAS certificate remained associated with the two controversies, which had occurred despite receiving such a certification. Therefore the JAS certificate also became tainted. For these reasons frozen food producers now rapidly shifted to the new certificate and eventually JAS certification for frozen food was abolished (Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, 2013a).

Table 3 about here

In addition to upgrading the certificate, the association coordinated guided factory tours in China. Journalists and consumer activists were invited to visit relevant factories in China, which took care of the significant amount of production and raw material supply for frozen food consumed in Japan then.¹ The tours for media companies were scheduled in June and October 2008 as follows:

- June 2-6 press tour that invited journalist from Yomiuri, Nikkei, Asahi, Mainichi, and Reito Shokuhin Shimbun newspapers
- October 6-11 press tour which invited journalist from Jiji Tsushin, Chunichi and Reito Shokuhin Shimbun newspapers as well as NHK (TV broadcasting company), Weekly Diamond (magazine publisher), Nikkei Restaurant (magazine publisher)

These tours firstly took the participants to farms producing vegetables and livestock associated with frozen food production. Then, followed by factory visits, which produced frozen food such as deep-fried dumplings, rice balls and frozen

¹ In 2009, 1,471,896 tonnes of frozen food was consumed in the country. Of these, 128,373 tonnes were exported from China, which accounted for approximately 10 percent (The Japan Frozen Food Association, 2009a).

vegetables. The factory visit entailed the observation of food quality inspection process that was composed of manual and mechanical procedures. After they were invited for sampling food produced there, the participants were invited to a meeting with governmental officials in China regarding their policy for ensuring food safety. Throughout the tours, the EA emphasised safe production and distribution of frozen food in Chinese factories, which were going to be accredited under the new certificate.

Following these, some of the media coverage now embraced the improved aspects of frozen food production such as the new certification system and stricter supply chain management internationally. These media 'consequences' were shared in the EA's monthly newsletters (December 2008, No.402) and trade papers (30 June 2008, 13 October 2008, Trade paper in frozen food 'Reito Shokuhin Shimbun [Newspaper for frozen food]') in frozen food:

- 5 June 2008 at Yomiuri Shimbun newspaper
- 18 June 2008 at Nikkei Shimbun newspaper
- 25 June 2008 at Mainichi Shimbun newspaper
- 18 July 2008 at Asahi Shimbun newspaper
- 9 October 2008 at Jiji Tsushin newspaper
- 18 October 2008 at NHK broadcasting company (a programme called 'Ohayo Nippon' [Good morning Japan])
- 27 October 2008 at Weekly Diamond
- 1 November 2008 at Nikkei Restaurant

The structure adopted for these articles were more or less same. They firstly introduced growing awareness of consumers regarding frozen food safety. Then, they explained details of the frozen food producers' efforts to guarantee safety such as the introduction of a new and stricter certificate system as well as high level of hygiene in factories in China. Of all these articles, pictures of Chinese factories were included in the articles with captions illustrating 'good' characteristics, such as the cutting edge facilities and strict inspection of hygiene level in the factory.

In March and August 2009, consumer activist groups were invited for similar guided tours in China. The detailed dates and participants can be seen as follows:

- March 10-13 factory tour which invited six consumer activist group members from four groups
- August 3-7 factory tour that invited five consumer activist group members from four groups

Following the tours, the EA organised a debriefing meeting (on 19 October 2009) together with consumer groups' members joining the tours, which let other members from the groups share the 'experience based on the right knowledge' (Fryer, 2009). This resulted in another debriefing meeting (on 9 February 2010), which was intended to 'remove the anxiety concerning frozen food produced in China' (Fryer, 2010). Moreover, some of the consumer activist members expressed their positive impressions about the factories of the frozen food producers in their newsletters and other media outlet, through statements such as that they were 'far cleaner than imagined' (National Federation of Regional Women's Organizations, 2009). This is a significant improvement since the newsletter from the same activist group issued in May 2008 questioned the production and distribution of frozen food ((National Federation of Regional Women's Organizations, 2008).

Conclusions

IR research has partially recognised the role of EAs in non-Western context, such as represented in studies focusing on research examining Japanese EAs in relation to Shunto. That said, their role in such context has not fully been examined. By adopting the concepts developed in OS, this study has provided insights into the EA's collective action, in particular, meta-organising for legitimacy recovery in the context of non-Western society. As this article demonstrates, the importance of employers' collective action is not limited to Western context.

In summary, reputational crises as documented here, necessitate efforts to repair legitimacy. Such repair work requires showing that existing arrangements have been upgraded to match prevailing standards in an 'acceptable' manner (Haislip et al., 2015; Richardson et al., 2015). Such repairing entails meta-organising. Key field actors involved in meta-organising was the industrial association, which 'tailored' relationship with frozen food manufacturers, ingredients suppliers, regulators, the mass media and consumer activist groups.

Furthermore, the study has specific contributions toward the research on legitimacy in three areas. First, it shows how meta-organising provides a way to repair legitimacy, when other means may not be available. Through

meta-organising industry-wide legitimacy, restoration can be addressed. Such meta-organising necessarily involves industry coordination; however as we have shown larger levels of mobilising take place during repair including coalition building with media and regulatory actors. Second, crises of legitimacy are key enabling conditions for meta-organising actions. Meta-organising may remain invisible in terms of daily actions and effects until a moment of crisis when it is exposed as a consequence of existing legitimacy facing significant problems. The labelling of meat products was taken for granted by industry and regulatory actors until the two crises unfolded of mis-labeling and contamination respectively. Meta-organising then can be seen as comprising doxic actions that become visible and amenable for refinement during moments of crisis. Finally, this paper shows that certification is an intriguing complement to efforts to repair legitimacy. The government sought to repair legitimacy after these two crises but was less successful than the industry actors. It is therefore reasonable to conclude that meta-organising comprises heterogeneous efforts that may both complement or compete with one another, support or undermine each other.

Finally, certain limitations of this article should be mentioned. The article concentrated on providing insights into the EA's meta-organising for legitimacy recovery. While the analysis of the article implied the potential (causal) linkage between meta-organising by the EA and legitimacy recovery in particular in terms of the perception of key stakeholders (the mass media and consumer activist groups). However, it should be pointed out that legitimacy is fairly complex issue. For example, during the period of analysis, a large earthquake hit the country and nuclear problem, in particular, became a major concern, which significantly impacted on legitimacy status of food, including frozen one. Thus, in the future research, paying further attention to contextual factors would be necessary.

REFERENCES

- Barry, M. (2016). Employer and employer association matters in Australia in 2015. *Journal of Industrial Relations*, 58(3), 340-355.
- Barry, M., & Wilkinson, A. (2011). Reconceptualising employer associations under evolving employment relations countervailing power revisited. *Work, Employment & Society*, 25(1), 149-162.
- Benson, J. (2012). Alternative dispute resolution in Japan: the rise of individualism. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 23(3),

511-527.

- Benson, J., & Gospel, H. (2008). The emergent enterprise union? A conceptual and comparative analysis. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 19(7), 1365-1382.
- Berkowitz, H., & Dumez, H. (2016). The Concept of Meta-Organization: Issues for Management Studies. *European Management Review*.
- Brunsson, N., Rasche, A., & Seidl, D. (2012). The dynamics of standardization: Three perspectives on standards in organization studies. *Organization Studies*, 33(5-6), 613-632.
- Déjean, F., Gond, J. P., & Leca, B. (2004). Measuring the unmeasured: An institutional entrepreneur strategy in an emerging industry. *Human relations*, 57(6), 741-764.
- Fligstein, N., & McAdam, D. (2012). *A theory of fields*. Oxford University Press.
- Forstenlechner, I., & Mellahi, K. (2011). Gaining legitimacy through hiring local workforce at a premium: The case of MNEs in the United Arab Emirates. *Journal of World Business*, 46(4), 455-461.
- Haislip, J. Z., Masli, A., Richardson, V. J., & Sanchez, J. M. (2015). Repairing Organizational Legitimacy Following Information Technology (IT) Material Weaknesses: Executive Turnover, IT Expertise, and IT System Upgrades. *Journal of Information Systems*, 30(1), 41-70.
- Hargadon, A. B., & Douglas, Y. (2001). When innovations meet institutions: Edison and the design of the electric light. *Administrative science quarterly*, 46(3), 476-501.
- Heusinkveld, S., Benders, J., & Hillebrand, B. (2013). Stretching concepts: The role of competing pressures and decoupling in the evolution of organization concepts. *Organization Studies*, 34(1), 7-32.
- Human, S. E., & Provan, K. G. (2000). Legitimacy building in the evolution of small-firm multilateral networks: A comparative study of success and demise. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 45(2), 327-365.
- Jonsson, S., Greve, H. R., & Fujiwara-Greve, T. (2009). Undeserved loss: The spread of legitimacy loss to innocent organizations in response to reported corporate deviance. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 54(2), 195-228.
- Keevers, L., & Sykes, C. (2016). Food and music matters: Affective relations and practices in social justice organizations. *Human Relations*, 0018726715621368.
- Kornelakis, A. (2014). Liberalization, flexibility and industrial relations institutions: evidence from Italian and Greek banking. *Work, Employment &*

Society, 28(1), 40-57

- Li, J., Yang, J. Y., & Yue, D. R. (2007). Identity, community, and audience: How wholly owned foreign subsidiaries gain legitimacy in China. *Academy of Management Journal*, 50(1), 175-190.
- Lutgen-Sandvik, P. (2008). Intensive remedial identity work: Responses to workplace bullying trauma and stigmatisation. *Organisation*, 15(1), 97-119.
- Misangyi, V. F., Weaver, G. R., & Elms, H. (2008). Ending corruption: The interplay among institutional logics, resources, and institutional entrepreneurs. *Academy of Management Review*, 33(3), 750-770.
- Nigam, A., & Ocasio, W. (2010). Event attention, environmental sensemaking, and change in institutional logics: An inductive analysis of the effects of public attention to Clinton's health care reform initiative. *Organization Science*, 21(4), 823-841.
- Olson, M. (2009). *The logic of collective action* (Vol. 124). Harvard University Press.
- O'Sullivan, M., & Royle, T. (2014). Everything and nothing changes: Fast-food employers and the threat to minimum wage regulation in Ireland. *Economic and Industrial Democracy*, 35(1), 27-47.
- Paetzold, R. L., Dipboye, R. L., & Elsbach, K. D. (2008). A new look at stigmatisation in and of organisations. *Academy of Management Review*, 33(1), 186-193.
- Palys, T. (2008). Purposive sampling. In L.M. Given (Ed.) *The Sage Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods*. (Vol.2). Sage: Los Angeles, pp. 697-8.
- Richardson, V., Peters, G., & Haislip, J. (2015). Do IT Auditors Aid in the Restoration of Control Legitimacy?. In *Academy of Management Proceedings* (Vol. 2015, No. 1, p. 18364). Academy of Management.
- Sako, M. (1997). Shunto: the Role of Employer and Union Coordination. In M. Sako and H. Sato, eds., *Japanese Labour and Management in Transition*. London: Routledge, pp.236-263.
- Sheldon, P., Nacamulli, R., Paoletti, F., & Morgan, D. E. (2014). Employer association responses to the effects of bargaining decentralization in Australia and Italy: seeking explanations from organizational theory. *British Journal of Industrial Relations*.
- Suchman, M. C. (1995). Managing legitimacy: Strategic and institutional approaches. *Academy of management review*, 20(3), 571-610.
- Suddaby, R., & Greenwood, R. (2005). Rhetorical strategies of legitimacy. *Administrative science quarterly*, 50(1), 35-67.
- Tracey, P., & Phillips, N. (2015). Managing the Consequences of Organizational

- Stigmatization: Identity Work in a Social Enterprise. *Academy of Management Journal*, amj-2013.
- Traxler, F. (2004). Employer associations, institutions and economic change. *Industrielle Beziehungen*, 11 (1), 42-60.
- Traxler, F. (2008). Employer associations. In P. Blyton, N. Bacon, J. Fiorito and E. Heery (eds.) *The Sage Handbook of Industrial Relations*, London: Sage.
- Traxler, F. (2010). The long term development of organised business and its implications for corporatism: A cross-national comparison of membership, activities and governing capacities of business interest associations, 1980-2001, *European Journal of Political Research*, 49 (2), 151-73.
- Vaara, E., Tienari, J., & Laurila, J. (2006). Pulp and paper fiction: On the discursive legitimation of global industrial restructuring. *Organization Studies*, 27(6), 789-813.

Online resources

(Corporate)

Corporate report (2007) Root causes of J-MinceCo's scandal

http://www.tablemark.co.jp/corp/ir/pdf/Pr530928_1.pdf

Corporate report (2008a) Countermeasure to J-MinceCo's scandal

<http://www.tablemark.co.jp/corp/ir/pdf/Pr530928.pdf>

Corporate report (2008b) Countermeasure to C-DumplingCo's scandal

https://www.jti.co.jp/investors/library/press_releases/2007/pdf/20080304_01.pdf

(Governmental)

Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (2007) Reconsidering JAS certificate (due to J-MinceCo incident)

http://www.maff.go.jp/j/jas/kaigi/pdf/070911_sokai_b.pdf

Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (2008) Updating JAS certificate for B-to-B transactions (16 January 2008)

http://www.maff.go.jp/j/jas/kaigi/pdf/080116_sokai_b.pdf

Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (2013a) Abolishing JAS for frozen food (22 March 2013)

http://www.maff.go.jp/j/jas/kaigi/pdf/130322_gjjiroku.pdf

Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (2013b)

The number of JAS accredited frozen food producers:

http://www.maff.go.jp/j/jas/kaigi/pdf/130322_sokai_j.pdf

(Consumer activist groups)

National Federation of Regional Women's Organizations (2008) Monthly newsletter (No.381, May 2008): Criticism for safety of frozen food

http://www.chifuren.gr.jp/kikanshi/news-bk/381/newsback-381_4.html

National Federation of Regional Women's Organizations (2009) Monthly newsletter (No.397, September 2009): Evaluating safety of frozen food production and distribution

http://www.chifuren.gr.jp/kikanshi/news-bk/397/newsback-397_3.html

Radio broadcasting station blog entry (21 March 2009): Interview transcript with a member of the Japan Consumers' Association (9 February 2010)

<http://abc1008.com/news/onair/090327.html>

Fryer (2009) Debriefing session of Chinese factory tours (between the EA and consumer activist groups, held on 19 October 2009)

http://www.reishokukyo.or.jp/wp-content/uploads/pdf/091116_public.pdf

Fryer (2010) Debriefing session of Chinese factory tours (for public, 9 February 2010) http://www.shodanren.gr.jp/Annai/pdf/246_01.pdf

(The Employers' Association)

The Japan Frozen Food Association (2008) Advertisements in major newspapers:

<http://www.pressnet.or.jp/adarc/ex/ex.html?dno=c0779>

The Japan Frozen Food Association (2009a) Frozen food production in 2009

http://www.reishokukyo.or.jp/wp-content/uploads/pdf/pdf-data_05.pdf

The Japan Frozen Food Association (2009b) Dissemination of new accreditation system:

<http://ryutsuu.biz/backnumber/topix/5230.html>

Table 1 Key events

Time	Events
Jun 2007	Media coverage identifying J-MinceCo's mislabelling
Jan 2008	Media coverage reporting food tampering by C-DumplingCo
Mar 2008	J-MinceCo's president was found guilty in mislabelling
Apr 2009	Updated industrial certificate for frozen food
Mar 2013	Abolition of JAS for frozen food
Jan 2014	C-DumplingCo's ex worker was found guilty in food tampering

Table 2 Sources of data

Source	Summary	Issues examined
Government	Judicial records (J-MinceCo) Investigation reports by the Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare (C-DumplingCo)	Process of the two food scandals by J-MinceCo and C-DumplingCo that triggered legitimacy crisis
Corporates	Self-investigation reports by those firms forming contracts with J-MinceCo and C-DumplingCo	
Association	Monthly newsletter (June 2007 – January 2014)	EA's meta-organising for legitimacy recovery
Consumer activist groups	Websites (report their participation to guided tours)	Perception of frozen food category Processes and consequences of EA's meta-organising for legitimacy recovery
Media	Major newspapers (performed keyword search 'Frozen food', 'J-MinceCo', 'C-DumplingCo' and 'Japan Frozen Food Association' in a leading newspaper's database, 779, 73, 103, and 18 articles respectively between June 2007 – January 2014) Trade papers in frozen food (examined manually and identified 38 relevant articles between June 2007 – January 2014) Newspaper articles as a result of guided tour (5 June 2009 at Yomiuri Shimbun newspaper, 18 June 2009 Nikkei Shimbun newspaper, 25 June 2009 Mainichi Shimbun newspaper, 18 July 2009 Asahi Shimbun newspaper, 9 October 2009 Jiji Tsushin newspaper, 27 October 2009 Weekly Diamond, 1 November 2009 Nikkei Restaurant)	

Table 3 The number of JAS accredited frozen food producers

Year	Number
2006	333
2007	150
2008	139
2009	1

2010	1
2011	0
2012	0
2013	Abolished

Source: Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (2013b)